

(e, M.P.) took the Chair and read prayers

### Messages

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** – Are there any messages from the President?

**The Clerk** – No.

### Notices of Motion

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Are there any notices of motion?

**The Clerk** ó No.

### Questions on Notice

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Are there any questions on notice? Sorry Mr. Star. We are still on notices of motion.

**Mr. Star (Buada)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, I move that this House calls upon the

**Mr. Gioura (Minister for Justice-Ubenide)** ó Point of order, the honourable Member for Buada is making a motion instead of giving notice.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Questions on notice.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** - Mr. Deputy Speaker, I am getting it ready.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Yes, but it is out of form.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Not yet out of form because it is ready now.

**Mr. Star (Buada)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, I give notice that at the next sitting, I shall move a motion.

**Mr. Ekwona (Minister for Education-Yaren)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, is it not proper for the honourable Member to give the gist of what he is talking about when he is giving notice.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó The honourable member for Buada, I think it best if you would give us the gist of your motion.

this House calls upon the government to consider the Manila with the management of the Pacific Star Building Consul-General as Manager of Pacific Star Building and the amalgamation.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó That to be seconded and handed, in writing to the Clerk.

### Questions on Notice

**Mr. Stephen (Ewa/Anetan)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, question No. 2.

**Mr. Dowiyogo (President-Ubenide)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, I am sorry to say that the answer of question No. 2 is not yet ready.

**Mr. Stephen (Ewa/Anetan)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, question No. 3.

**Mr. Dowiyogo (President-Ubenide)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, as I have said, I do not have all the answers yet to all questions on notice available at this time.

### Questions without Notice

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Mr. Speaker, I address a question to the Minister for Finance. And I would like to preface my question.

The Minister last night, during the committee deliberations of the Telecommunications head was asked various questions in respect to the changeover from the OTC establishment, to OTCI, to AT&T. He was also asked the total of the moneys involved in the contracts with both establishments, and what happened to the moneys given for the contract with OTCI. Further, he was asked to explain why the OTCI contract with Nauru was terminated. To all these questions the Minister debated, with the exception of a very big answer that the contract with OTCI was lost.

**Mr. Gioura (Minister for Justice-Ubenide)** ó Point of order.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó A point of order has been raised.

**Mr. Gioura (Minister for Justice-Ubenide)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, I draw your attention to the rules of questions. That there is a Standing Order of rules on questions relating to matters which are in committee proceedings. That such questions should not be asked. Because if the matter the Member raises pending

**Voice** ó It is no longer a pending question.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó The point of order is maintained by the Deputy Speaker.

at there is substance in that point of order.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Why? What is your Standing Order. Because the Minister did not quote any Standing Order. So what is your Standing Order? Would you like to enlighten me.

**Mr. Gioura (Minister for Justice-Ubenide)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, it's Standing Order 109 sub-clause (c).

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Kindly take note of that Standing Order and adhere to it.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Yes, Mr. Deputy Speaker, have you read S.O. 109 (c). Because I'm reading it and my point is, have you read it? You have supported the Point of Order. Why are you making rulings without referring to Standing Orders.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Because I don't need Standing Orders.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó What do you need then?

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó I don't need nothing, I know you're not allowed to anticipate.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó What anticipation?

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Anything that you're going to come up with.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó And you know very well as Chairman of the Committee, that we have passed Telecommunications so what the hell are you talking about.

**Mr. Gioura (Minister for Justice-Ubenide)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, I think you should name the honourable Member for unruly behaviour. Because the Standing Order is there. S.O.109( c) ó Rules of questions. Questions are not asked on proceedings in committee which have not been placed before the House by report form the committee.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó I take note of that.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó That is exactly besides the point Mr. Deputy Speaker. Last night, the committee reported progress to the House with amendments. And Head Telecommunications has been referred to the House. There is no substance in that point of order.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó There is substance and its for you now to say you dissent from the Chair.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, I dissent from your ruling.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó It seems that the Deputy Speaker's ruling has been dissented fromí .

easy and hold your horse. You're making a mockery of this House, I think.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó No I am not making a mockery of anything.

**Mr. Stephen (Ewa/Anetan)** ó So please hold your horse.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó I got no horse.

**Mr. Stephen (Ewa/Anetan)** ó You know what I mean. So please, before he dissents from your ruling, can you look at that point of order and see whether it is valid or invalid.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Mr. Adeang dissents from my ruling. Those of the opinion say aye, contrary no.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, I wish to debate the censure.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó I don't think that there's any debate allowed.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó What is your Standing Order on that?

Mr. Deputy Speaker, I dissented from your ruling for various reasons. One which is quite obvious to this House is that you did not even consider this Standing Order which was raised, that there was no Standing Order raised, that you agreed with that point of order, without any point of order being raised.

Secondly you agreed with the Standing Order 109( c ) as having prevented me, without referring to that Standing Order yourself.

Thirdly, on the merit itself of that Standing Order, I submit that your interpretation and your application of Standing Order 209 ( c ) is erroneous. Standing Order 109 ( c ) reads ó questions shall not be asked about proceedings in Committee which have not been placed before the House by report from the Committee.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, as I've indicated to you earlier, the committee before it adjourned, reported progress to the House, and in that Progress Report reported to the Speaker, that they have reached a certain stage of the consideration of the Estimates. The stage reached, included the consideration of Head Telecommunications. Therefore all those Heads which had been considered in the Committee have been placed before the House by report from the Committee, exactly as S.O.109 stated. S.O. 109 ( c ) requires that before you can ask proceedings in the Committee. The proceedings in the Committee must first be placed before the House, by report from the Committee. That means that they must have already been dealt with in the Committee when it reported to the House. This is what this is all about. There is no difficulty in the English wording and the intention. There is no problem whatsoever in my opinion, we have dealt with the Head Telecommunications.

ness, the Committee has reported to the House that it has does not apply here, although the Minister raised a point of anticipation. I am anticipating it.

ó you should not raise any matter when the same matter has already been referred to the House or to the Committee.

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** ó Point of order, Mr. Deputy Speaker.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó A point of order has been raised by Mr. Harris.

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** ó Please correct me Mr. Deputy Speaker. One can dissent from a ruling, if it is a ruling from the Chair. Now can one dissent from a ruling when it is a ruling of the Standing Orders? Because although you made a ruling, it is not a ruling, it is a confirmation of what is in the Standing Orders. There fore the point, which Mr. Gioura brought up, which, youøve agreed to, is a Standing Order. That was not a ruling, you didnøt give a ruling. You just agreed that what Mr. Gioura said was a Standing Order. So therefore there is no ruling to be dissented from. Youøre just confirming that it is in the Standing Order.

So there fore the motion that he dissents from you ruling is out of order. Yours is not a ruling, yours is a confirmation that its ÿesøit is by the book. You didnøt rule on things. This is that youøre merely saying that Mr. Gioura is right. Itø not a ruling. If he disagrees he has to suspend Standing Orders. Heø not dissenting to a ruling. You did not give a ruling. You just said yes. He just stood up and said òpoint of orderö, you said, òvalid pointö. You did not give a ruling.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Youøre not giving any opinions Mr. Deputy Speaker, you have ruled that the point of order raised applies. That is your ruling. The ruling from the Chair is that the point of order raised is correct. That is a ruling and that is what I am dissenting from. Thatø fantastic logic from Mr. Harris. And I shall continue.

*(Between the two Members they're interjecting)í .*

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** ó Deputy Speaker, I suggest we take a break to look into this. You did not give a ruling.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Are you saying thatí

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** ó Yes itø in order or itø out of order.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Is that not a ruling?

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** ó No.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó What kind of logic are you applying?



 Your complimentary use period has ended. Thank you for using PDF Complete.  
[Click Here to upgrade to Unlimited Pages and Expanded Features](#)

ing, it's a Standing Order. If you do not agree you have to

ling and I will go

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** ó Mr. Speaker, you make rulings on things which are here. Those are rulings which are here.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Yes, but if you did not apply the Standing Order properly, you made a ruling which is contrary to the Standing Order. Is that no so?

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** - No, no. No.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó That is the issue Mr. Deputy Speaker. The point was raised because the question was out of order, because it contravened S.O.109 ( c ). That was the point of order raised. Now the Chair has ruled that there is substance to that point of order raised. That is a ruling from the Chair, and to which I dissented. This is it and this is why, I'm up here standing to explain why I am dissenting from the ruling of the Chair. That's the logic.

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** ó Point of clarification. Mr. Deputy Speaker, do you mean to tell me now that whenever somebody makes a point of order, he should sit down and put the point of order.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó You're sitting down.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, is he rising to a point of order or what?

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** ó Yes yes. Mr. Deputy Speaker, we should clarify this. If a Standing Order says that one is out of order, and you concur, does one have to dissent from each and every individual Standing Order? Is that procedure? The procedure is that you suspend.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó That's right, exactly.

**Mr. Stephen (Ewa/Anetan)** ó No, no, no. You rule on that particular one.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó But whatever the Standing Orders say, I must obey. (*All Members interjecting at this point.*)

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Mr. Deputy Speaker, do you know what you're saying?

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Yes, I have been supported by this bible. The Bible of this House.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Yes but what you're doing Mr. Deputy Speaker is that you are not using the Standing Orders correctly. And if you are not using the Standing Orders correctly, I should dissent from the way you use that Standing Order, and that's exactly what I was doing. You don't

misapplied it yourself. If it is correct, then I will seek  
Is it now clearer to you Mr. Deputy Speaker?

disension of yours is out of order.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Ohí and I dissent from that ruling. You're ruling me out of order, are you ruling that my disension is out of order? Therefore I dissent from that ruling.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Mr. Adeang you must read your S.O.9  
( c ) which saysí ask by the proceedings in Committee which have not been placed in the  
Houseí

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó There is no No. 9(c) Mr. Deputy Speaker. Ther is no S.O.9(c)í

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó S.O.109(c).

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Right. S.O.109(c) and that is what I'm dissenting from.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó í questions shall not ask about proceedings in Committee which have not  
been placed before the House by Report from the Committee.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** - í right. Did you read that yourself. òí which have not been placed  
before the Houseö by report of the Committee. Did you not report it to the Speaker last night, that  
we've already considered certain Heads.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó Not, that's only part of the process.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Yes, that's only part, but you made a report on it.

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** ó Point of order. I understand the quandary of the Member. But he should  
have respect. He just gets up and directs the Chair, without the Chair seeing him. He was not  
noticed and he should not speak.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** ó And the S.O.109(c) says, òí a person shall not ask about proceedings in  
Committee which have been placed before the House by report from the Committee. That's it.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** ó Yes, after you read that again this is exactly what we're going to do.  
We have to understand, Mr. Deputy Speaker, whether proceedings have been placed before the  
House by reports from the Committee.

Now Mr. Deputy Speaker, I ask you, did you or did you not make a report tot he House?  
That's a report what is it? A progress what, a progress report, yes. It is a report. It is a report and  
do you not agree? Or are you going to say progress -shitø is it progress something? Or is it a  
progress report.

...n when the Deputy Speaker is talking to you. You must  
...rt itself and a progress report.

...peaker, why don't you allow me to finish my debate.

**Mr. Detenamo (Minister for Works-Buada)** – Point of order. Amea Honourable Member kiyiyuw, eke shit ngarana Chair. Aiki ngaga amea Honourable Member kiyiyuw, ateng en draw eiyaw wam attention.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** – Mr. Adeang, you must withdraw that statement.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** – Mr. Deputy Speaker, eko bedbid aeo iya ouga. Pwer deningon amea. What I'm saying is there a report.

**Mr. Detenamo (Minister for Works-Ubenide)** – Mr. Deputy Speaker, iya ar nim oni record, it will bear me out, that he said 'progress shit'

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** – Edaga me that's progress shit. Do you see, he's quoted me exactly. What I am saying is that it's a report.

**Mr. Dowiyogo (President-Ubenide)** – Me ada ngarena edorer eiy owenon, is it parliamentary language?

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** – I don't think so. Well he must withdraw that.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** – Well, I withdraw that. Easy I withdraw it. The point is ó it's a report & I do not know what these people are talking about.

**Mr. Harris (Aiwo)** – Mr. Deputy Speaker, the rules of spending in this House, are that he stands up and then you notice if he has stood up but he talked without even being noticed.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** – Well, you can all be quiet now. The difference is between the progress report and the report itself.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** – What is the difference , Mr. Deputy Speaker.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** – The difference is progress ó is still being processed, of being complete.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** – And then whats the other one?

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** – A report is when the House has studied Bill completely and reports it.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** – You're being descriptive, what you want is the world 'full report'. One is progress report.





Your complimentary  
use period has ended.  
Thank you for using  
PDF Complete.

is being raised.

slanging match or what?

[Click Here to upgrade to  
Unlimited Pages and Expanded Features](#)

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** – We’re engaging in a slanging match, Mr. Adeang. And you should stop for you’re old enough to know better.

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** – Mr. Deputy Speaker, maybe you’re past being old know that.

**Mr. Deputy Speaker** – We’re alright now. We are now on questions without notice.

### **Question Without Notice.**

**Mr. Adeang (Ubenide)** – My question is to the Minister for Finance. Was that ó in relations to those answers. One matter which caused me concern was that he said about the Republic and the OTCI relationship, contractual relationship. That having completed the installation of the international dial direct telephone system, the contract lapsed. Despite it having us millions of dollars, there were only fifteen telephones available.